

**REVIEW OF THE PUBLICATION,
*LIVING WITHOUT LANDFILLS***



NCRP COMMENTARY NO. 5

REVIEW OF THE PUBLICATION, *LIVING WITHOUT LANDFILLS*

Issued: July 31, 1989
First Reprinting December 21, 1989
National Council on Radiation Protection and Measurements
7910 Woodmont Avenue, Bethesda, Maryland 20814

 **Documents**
NCRP 2011 All rights reserved.
HPS Member Copy Document Sharing Hub
Single use only, copying and networking prohibited

LEGAL NOTICE

This report was prepared by the National Council on Radiation Protection and Measurements (NCRP). The Council strives to provide accurate, complete and useful information in its reports. However, neither the NCRP, the members of NCRP, other persons contributing to or assisting in the preparation of this report, nor any person acting on the behalf of any of these parties (a) makes any warranty or representation, express or implied, with respect to the accuracy, completeness or usefulness of the information contained in this report, or that the use of any information, method or process disclosed in this report may not infringe on privately owned rights; or (b) assumes any liability with respect to the use of, or for damages resulting from the use of, any information, method or process disclosed in this report.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Review of the publication, Living without landfills.

(NCRP commentary ; no. 5)

Bibliography: p.

1. Resnikoff, Marvin. Living without landfills.
2. Radioactive waste disposal in the ground—Environmental aspects—United States. 3. Radioactive waste sites—Environmental aspects—United States.
I. National Council on Radiation Protection and Measurements. II. Series.
TD898.2.R473R48 1989 363.72'87 89-35181
ISBN 0-929600-06-1

Copyright © National Council on Radiation
Protection and Measurements 1989

All rights reserved. This publication is protected by copyright. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, including photocopying, or utilized by any information storage and retrieval system without written permission from the copyright owner, except for brief quotation in critical articles or reviews.

Preface

This commentary is a review of the report, *Living Without Landfills*, published by the Radioactive Waste Campaign (RWC) in September, 1987. The NCRP was asked by EG&G Idaho, a contractor of the U.S. Department of Energy, to consider reviewing the report. The NCRP Board of Directors decided that it would serve the public interest to establish a scientific group to carry out such a review. By agreeing to review the report, NCRP set a precedent. Never before had the Council established a panel to review a document prepared by another organization. However, the subject of radioactive waste management involves such important questions of public policy, that, in the opinion of the Board, it was appropriate that the Council utilize the expertise of its members to prepare an analysis of the report in question.

Serving on Scientific Committee 64-15 during preparation of the Commentary were:

Merrill Eisenbud, Chairman
Professor Emeritus of Environmental Medicine
New York University Medical Center
Adjunct Professor of Environmental Science and Engineering
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, North Carolina

Members

Roger W. Granlund
University Health Physicist
Pennsylvania State University
University Park, Pennsylvania

Frank L. Parker
Distinguished Professor of
Environmental Science and
Engineering
Vanderbilt University
Nashville, Tennessee

William R. Hendee
Vice President for Science
and Technology
American Medical Association
Chicago, Illinois

Paul Slovic
President
Decision Research
Eugene, Oregon

NCRP Secretariat—E. Ivan White

Melvin W. Carter, Chairman of Scientific committee 64 on Environmental Radioactivity and Waste management assisted the Board of Directors in connection with the review of this commentary.

The Council wishes to express its appreciation to the committee members for the time and effort devoted to the preparation of this Commentary.

Bethesda, Maryland
February 15, 1989

Warren K. Sinclair
President, NCRP

Contents

Preface	iii
Summary	1
1. Introduction	1
2. Exclusion of Relevant Information	2
3. Misstatement of Facts	4
4. Examples of Exaggeration and Bias	5
5. Examples of Faulty Logic	7
6. Conclusion	8
References	9