

CAA Response to AAIB Recommendation 2016-037/2016-038



Requirement

Following the tragic crash of Hunter G-BXFI at Shoreham in 2015, the following Safety Recommendations 2016-037 and 2016-038 were made:

Safety Recommendation 2016-037 'It is recommended that the Civil Aviation Authority require that displaying aircraft are separated from the public by a sufficient distance to minimise the risk of injury to the public in the event of an accident to the displaying aircraft'

Safety Recommendation 2016-038 'It is recommended that the Civil Aviation Authority specify the minimum separation distances between secondary crowd areas and display aircraft before issuing a Permission under Article 162 of the Air Navigation Order.'

Following discussions between AAIB and CAA it was agreed for the CAA's response to recommendations 2016-037 and 2016-038 to be combined as detailed below:

The CAA will conduct a review, within six months of publication by the MAA of a study by Frazer-Nash, to consider whether any changes are required to the minimum distance that display aircraft are to be separated from the public (primary and secondary crowds) to effectively minimise the risk of injury to the public in the event of an accident to the displaying aircraft. In the event that this study does not deliver a clear output or is terminated, for any reason, the CAA will consider what additional work will be needed to resolve this Recommendation. Subject to the findings of the study and the outcome of the review, the CAA shall make any necessary revisions to the application process for Permissions granted under Article 86 of the Air Navigation Order 2016.

This combined response to AAIB 2016-037 and AAIB 2016-038 was assessed by AAIB as 'Adequate-Closed' in 'Aircraft Accident Report (AAR) 1/2017 – G-BXFI'.

Actions

The CAA:

- Reviewed the analysis contained in the 1993 Cranfield report into Airshow Separation Distances.
- Conducted a review of the MAA's own Study into Air Display Crowd Distances, to consider whether any changes were required to the minimum distance that (civil) display aircraft are to be separated from the public.
- Incorporated actions to prevent the gathering of secondary crowds protect third parties into CAP 403: Flying Displays and Special Events: Safety and Administrative Requirements and Guidance.

Recommendations

The CAA will:

- **Continue to use the extant display separation distances** as it has been determined that moving the display line closer to the crowd would increase the risk to the public.
- **Review light aircraft exemptions** where such aircraft are exempted from the standard separation distance inside the 150 metre crowd-to-display line to establish whether existing risk analysis around light aircraft exemptions continues to provide adequate protection for the public.

Background

Following the tragic crash of Hunter G-BXFI at Shoreham in 2015, a number of safety recommendations were made by the AAIB. AAIB recommendation 2016-037 and 2016-038 required that the CAA to set a minimum separation distance for display aircraft from the public.

2016-037

Safety Recommendation 2016-037 'It is recommended that the Civil Aviation Authority require that displaying aircraft are separated from the public by a sufficient distance to minimise the risk of injury to the public in the event of an accident to the displaying aircraft'

The initial CAA response (09 June 2016) to AAIB 2016-037 was:

The CAA understands that this recommendation relates to members of the public attending a flying display. The CAA accepts this recommendation. The MAA has commissioned an independent study into crowd separation distances. This research is ongoing and should report in 2017. As the MAA research is ongoing, the CAA decided in its review of UK civil air displays that, as an interim measure, where current MAA crowd separation distances are higher it would align with them. The increased distances were announced in April this year in the final report of the CAA's Review of UK Civil Air Displays. The CAA will confirm crowd separation distances after the independent study commissioned by the MAA into crowd separation distances reports in 2017.

This response was regarded as 'Not Adequate' by the AAIB and remained open. The CAA response to this recommendation was updated on 24 January 2017 which was considered as 'Adequate' by the AAIB and 'closed'.

2016-038

Safety Recommendation 2016-38 'It is recommended that the Civil Aviation Authority specify the minimum separation distances between secondary crowd areas and display aircraft before issuing a Permission under Article 162 of the Air Navigation Order.